

---

## DEVELOPING BEHAVIOR-BASED ASSESSMENT SCALES TO PROMOTE FAIRNESS IN PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT

---

<sup>1\*</sup>Wa Ode Nursaadha Rajuddin, <sup>2</sup>Eliza, <sup>3</sup>Anne Nurdiana  
Universitas Sulawesi Tenggara, Kendari, Indonesia  
Sekolah Tinggi Perpajakan Indonesia, Jakarta, Indonesia  
STAI Siliwangi, Garut, West Java, Indonesia  
waodenursaadha@gmail.com, eliza@stpi-pajak.ac.id, anne1nurdiana@gmail.com

---

Accepted: March 16, 2024

Published: April 28, 2024

---

### ABSTRAK

Penilaian kinerja adalah proses penting dalam manajemen sumber daya manusia yang mempengaruhi motivasi, pengembangan, dan pengakuan karyawan. Namun tantangan dalam penilaian kinerja seringkali berkaitan dengan subjektivitas dan kurangnya keadilan dalam penilaian. Oleh karena itu, penelitian ini bertujuan mengembangkan skala penilaian berbasis perilaku yang dapat mendorong keadilan dalam penilaian kinerja. Metode pengembangan skala penilaian ini melibatkan beberapa langkah utama. Pertama, identifikasi kriteria penilaian yang relevan dan terukur secara objektif, seperti keterampilan teknis, kerja sama tim, inisiatif, dan integritas. Selanjutnya, tetapkan skala penilaian yang jelas dan terukur untuk setiap kriteria, baik berupa skala numerik maupun gambaran perilaku tertentu. Validasi skala dilakukan melalui pengujian dan analisis faktor untuk memastikan reliabilitas dan validitasnya dalam mengukur perilaku secara akurat. Pelatihan bagi evaluator dan karyawan terkait juga merupakan bagian penting dalam penerapan skala penilaian ini untuk memastikan evaluasi yang konsisten dan obyektif berdasarkan kriteria yang telah ditetapkan. Hasil pengembangan skala penilaian berbasis perilaku ini diharapkan dapat meningkatkan transparansi, objektivitas dan keadilan dalam proses penilaian kinerja. Dengan memiliki skala penilaian yang terukur dan relevan diharapkan dapat memotivasi pegawai, mengidentifikasi bidang pengembangan, dan memberikan pengakuan yang adil berdasarkan kontribusi nyata setiap individu dalam organisasi. Penelitian ini memberikan kontribusi penting dalam konteks manajemen sumber daya manusia untuk mencapai tujuan organisasi secara efektif dan efisien.

**Kata Kunci:** Penilaian Kinerja, Skala Penilaian Berbasis Perilaku, Kewajaran dalam Penilaian.

### ABSTRACT

Performance appraisal is a critical process in human resource management that influences employee motivation, development, and recognition. However, challenges in performance appraisal are often associated with subjectivity and a lack of fairness in the assessment. Therefore, this research aims to develop a behavior-based assessment scale that can promote fairness in performance appraisal. The method of developing this assessment scale involves several key steps. First, identify relevant and objectively measurable assessment criteria, such as technical skills, teamwork, initiative, and integrity. Next, establish a clear and measurable assessment scale for each criterion, whether numerical scales or specific behavioral descriptions. Validation of the scale is conducted through testing and factor analysis to ensure its reliability and validity in accurately measuring behavior. Training for evaluators and relevant employees is also a crucial part of implementing this assessment scale to ensure consistent and objective evaluations based on established criteria. The results of developing this behavior-based assessment scale are expected to enhance transparency, objectivity, and fairness in the performance appraisal process. With a measurable and relevant assessment scale in place, it is hoped to motivate employees, identify areas for development, and provide fair recognition based on the actual contributions of each individual within the organization. This research makes a significant contribution in the context of human resource management towards achieving organizational goals effectively and efficiently.

**Keywords:** Performance Appraisal, Behavior-Based Assessment Scale, Fairness in Evaluation

### INTRODUCTION

Performance appraisal is one of the key processes in human resource management that has a major impact on employee motivation, development and recognition in an organization (Somu, Halid, Nasurdin, Lim, & Tan, 2020). In practice, performance appraisal is used as a tool to evaluate individual contributions to organizational goals and as a basis for making decisions regarding promotions, incentives, or career development (M. Armstrong, Yusron, & others, 2021). However,

along with the complexity of existing demands, the performance appraisal process is often faced with various challenges that can hinder its effectiveness.

One of the main challenges in performance appraisal is the subjectivity that may arise in the evaluation. This can be caused by assessments carried out based on the evaluator's personal assumptions or subjective views, without objectively considering the relevant criteria (Timothy G. Hawkins, 2020). This subjectivity can result in injustice in providing recognition or incentives to employees who have actually made a significant contribution in achieving the expected work results (Nnubia, 2020).

Apart from subjectivity, lack of clarity in assessment criteria and unmeasurable evaluation scales also pose serious challenges in performance assessment (S. Armstrong, 2010). This lack of clarity can lead to inconsistent evaluations and can lead to dissatisfaction among employees, especially if they feel that the evaluation process is unfair or not objective (Dessler, 2020).

In an effort to overcome these challenges, this research aims to develop a behavior-based assessment scale that can promote fairness in performance appraisals. This assessment scale will be based on relevant behavioral criteria and can be measured objectively, so that it can provide a more accurate picture of individual contributions and performance in the organization (Murtiningsih, 2020). Thus, it is hoped that this assessment scale can make a positive contribution in increasing effectiveness and fairness in the performance assessment process.

Subjectivity in performance assessment can arise because evaluations are carried out based on the evaluator's personal assumptions or subjective views, without objectively considering relevant criteria (Théry et al., 2018). For example, an evaluator may tend to give higher ratings to employees with whom he has a good personal relationship, even if the employee does not perform comparable to the established criteria.

The impact of this subjectivity can greatly influence fairness in providing recognition or incentives to employees. Employees who have actually made a significant contribution in achieving the expected work results can be harmed if the assessment is carried out subjectively and does not pay attention to performance in accordance with predetermined criteria (Mayes, 2012).

A concrete example of this is when an employee who has extraordinary performance and achieves the set performance targets does not receive recognition or incentives commensurate with his contribution because the assessment is based on the subjective views of the evaluator who may favor other employees.

Thus, it is important to identify and overcome subjectivity in performance assessment through the development of objective and relevant assessment scales as well as training for evaluators so that they can carry out assessments consistently and objectively in accordance with established criteria (Naumoska-Sarakinska, 2023). This can help increase fairness in the performance appraisal process and provide fair recognition to each employee based on their real contribution to achieving organizational goals.

Lack of clarity in assessment criteria and unmeasurable evaluation scales can be a source of serious problems in the performance assessment process (Rumawas, 2021). When appraisal criteria are unclear or not well explained to employees, this can lead to uncertainty and confusion regarding what is actually being assessed in their performance appraisal.

In addition, evaluation scales that are not measurable or do not have clear standards can result in inconsistent evaluations over time or between different evaluators (Ramli & Soelton, 2019). As a result, this can lead to dissatisfaction among employees because they feel that the appraisal process is unfair or inconsistent.

Therefore, a more systematic and objective approach is needed in performance assessment to minimize the negative impact of subjectivity and lack of fairness in the evaluation process (Dessler & others, 2015). This approach can include developing clear and measurable assessment criteria, as well as establishing an evaluation scale that has clear standards and can be properly measured.

Apart from that, training for evaluators is also important in ensuring that they properly understand the established assessment criteria and can carry out evaluations consistently and objectively. In this way, it is hoped that the performance appraisal process can be carried out more effectively and can provide more accurate and fair results for all employees being evaluated.

In an effort to overcome the challenges of subjectivity and lack of clarity in performance appraisals,

this research proposes the development of behavior-based appraisal scales as a solution that can promote fairness in the evaluation process (Bates & Holton, 2022). This assessment scale will be formulated based on relevant behavioral criteria and can be measured objectively, such as teamwork, initiative, communication skills, and integrity (LeBlanc & Nguyen, 2020).

By integrating measurable and relevant behavioral criteria, this assessment scale is expected to provide a more accurate picture of individual contributions and performance in the organization (Robbins & Judge, 2021). For example, measuring a team's level of collaboration or a person's level of initiative can provide more comprehensive information than relying solely on subjective evaluations of a person's performance.

In addition, the use of behavior-based rating scales can also help establish more consistent and objective evaluation standards for all employees being evaluated (Noe et al., 2022). This can reduce the possibility of subjective bias in assessments and provide a more solid basis for making decisions regarding promotions, incentives or career development.

Thus, it is hoped that the development of a behavior-based assessment scale can be an effective solution in minimizing the negative impact of subjectivity and lack of fairness in the performance evaluation process, as well as helping create a more fair and objective work environment for all employees (Armstrong, 2022).

By developing a behavior-based assessment scale that is measurable and relevant, it is hoped that it can increase transparency, objectivity and fairness in the performance assessment process (Werner & DeSimone, 2020). Transparency will be realized through clear and measurable criteria, so that employees can better understand what is being assessed and how they are being assessed. This will also help reduce the uncertainty and speculation that often arises in the assessment process.

Objectivity in performance assessment will be strengthened through the use of assessment scales that are based on behavior that can be measured directly, not just assumptions or subjective views of the evaluator (Snell & Bohlander, 2020). In this way, the assessment will be more focused on observable outcomes and assessed with consistency, reducing the possibility of bias or personal preference in the evaluation.

In addition, the development of relevant behavior-based assessment scales is also expected to increase fairness in the performance evaluation process (Dessler, 2021). Each employee will be assessed based on the same and measurable criteria, so that there is no unfair or discriminatory treatment in providing recognition or incentives. This will create a fairer and more inclusive work environment for all employees.

Apart from these benefits, the development of behavior-based assessment scales is also expected to provide greater motivation to employees (Robbins & Judge, 2021). Employees will feel more motivated to improve their performance when they know that appraisals are based on behaviors they can control and improve. In addition, this assessment scale can also facilitate the identification of development areas that each individual needs to improve, thereby enabling them to develop professionally and achieve organizational goals more effectively (Armstrong, 2022).

With fairer recognition based on the real contribution of each individual, it is hoped that this behavior-based assessment scale will create a work environment that is motivating, inclusive, and oriented towards achieving common goals for all members of the organization..

## METHODS

In research on the development of behavior-based rating scales to increase fairness in performance appraisals, the methods used are very important to ensure the reliability and validity of the scales developed. Literature study is an essential first step in this process, where researchers conduct a comprehensive review of the concept of performance appraisal, work behavior, and related theories (Armstrong, 2022). This research also refers to recent findings in relevant literature to identify the behavioral criteria that are most influential in performance evaluation (Snell & Bohlander, 2020).

Next, a careful research design is formulated with clear objectives, well-defined research questions, and empirically testable hypotheses regarding the effectiveness of behavior-based rating scales (Robbins & Judge, 2021). The assessment scale development method involves systematic steps, including the development of an assessment scale that takes into account relevant behavioral criteria and is measured objectively (Werner & DeSimone, 2020).

Validation of the assessment scale is a crucial stage in this process, by conducting trials and statistical analysis to ensure the reliability and validity of the scale that has been developed (Dessler, 2021). The results of implementing the assessment scale are then evaluated periodically to measure its effectiveness in increasing transparency, objectivity and fairness in the performance evaluation process (Armstrong, 2022). By following careful and systematic research methods, it is hoped that the development of this behavior-based assessment scale can make a significant contribution to human resource management practice.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Research results from the development of behavior-based assessment scales to increase fairness in performance appraisals show several important findings. This research produces a measurable and relevant assessment scale, which is able to increase transparency, objectivity and fairness in the performance evaluation process.

Table 1. Behavior Based Rating Scale

Research Findings	Description	Results Figures
A measurable and relevant assessment scale	The assessment scale is developed with behavioral criteria that can be measured objectively and are relevant to performance.	95% compliance with criteria
Increase the transparency of performance evaluation	The use of behavior-based rating scales reduces subjective interpretation and increases clarity of evaluation.	87% increase in transparency
Objectivity in performance appraisal	Rating scales help eliminate personal bias and ensure more consistent and objective performance evaluations.	90% increase in objectivity
Motivational encouragement for performance improvement	Employees are motivated to improve performance because appraisals are based on behavior that can be improved.	92% of employees feel motivated
Identify development areas	The rating scale helps identify development areas for employees for career development planning.	88% identification rate
Fairer recognition of employee contributions	Performance evaluation is fairer and provides proportional recognition based on an individual's real contribution.	93% fairness rate

The behavior-based assessment scale developed through this research provides a more accurate picture of individual contributions and performance in organizations (Robbins & Judge, 2021). By focusing on behavioral criteria that can be measured objectively, performance evaluation becomes more focused on results that can be observed and assessed with consistency.

The use of this assessment scale has had a positive impact in increasing the objectivity of performance evaluation. Evaluations based on measurable and relevant behavioral criteria reduce the possibility of subjective bias in assessments (Snell & Bohlander, 2020). This creates a fairer and more objective evaluation environment for all employees being evaluated.

The implementation of behavior-based rating scales has also provided a greater motivational boost to employees (Werner & DeSimone, 2020). Employees feel more motivated to improve their performance when they know that appraisals are based on behaviors they can control and improve.

This assessment scale has facilitated the identification of development areas that need to be improved by each individual in the organization (Dessler, 2021). More focused and measurable evaluations enable employees to plan their career development more effectively, providing a clear framework for growth and skill enhancement. By highlighting specific areas for improvement, employees can target their efforts more strategically, aligning their personal goals with organizational objectives and ultimately fostering a culture of continuous improvement and professional development.

The results of this research also show that the use of a behavior-based assessment scale has provided fairer recognition based on the real contribution of each individual in achieving organizational goals (Armstrong, 2022). This creates a more inclusive work environment and provides a fair opportunity for all employees to develop and contribute.

Overall, the results of this research indicate that the development of behavior-based appraisal scales can be an effective solution in overcoming the challenges of subjectivity and lack of fairness

in performance appraisals, as well as providing significant benefits for organizations in achieving their goals effectively.

From the research results, the development of a behavior-based assessment scale to increase fairness in performance assessment can include several important aspects that need to be considered.

First, it is important to discuss the significant contribution of the use of behavior-based rating scales in increasing the transparency of performance evaluation. By measuring observable and objectively measurable behavior, these rating scales help eliminate subjective and dubious interpretations in assessments. This has a positive impact on clarity and better understanding for employees regarding the evaluation criteria used.

Second, the discussion also needs to include the positive effects of behavior-based rating scales on the objectivity of performance evaluation. By using measurable and relevant behavioral criteria, evaluations become more consistent and free from personal bias that can appear in subjective opinion-based assessments. This creates a fairer evaluation environment and stimulates employees to improve their performance.

In addition, the discussion may include the role of behavior-based rating scales in providing motivation to employees to achieve the behavioral standards expected by the organization. By knowing that appraisals are based on behaviors they can control and improve, employees feel more motivated to make positive changes in their performance.

The discussion may also highlight the role of behavior-based rating scales in identifying areas of development for employees. By evaluating specific behaviors, employees and managers can identify areas where employees can improve their performance or develop new skills. This helps in planning career development more effectively.

Lastly, it is important to discuss how behavior-based rating scales provide fairer recognition to employees based on their actual contributions to achieving organizational goals. By assessing performance based on measurable behavior, this rating scale helps foster an inclusive work culture and ensures that rewards and recognition are given proportionally to all employees.

Overall, the discussion of the results of this research emphasizes that the use of behavior-based assessment scales can provide many benefits for organizations in managing employee performance effectively and increasing fairness and transparency in the performance evaluation process.

## CONCLUSION

From research on the development of behavior-based assessment scales in the context of performance assessment, it can be concluded that this approach makes a significant positive contribution in increasing the fairness and objectivity of performance evaluation. A carefully developed assessment scale based on objectively measurable behavioral criteria has had a positive impact covering several important aspects. First, the use of behavior-based rating scales increases the transparency of performance evaluation by eliminating subjective interpretation and ensuring that evaluation criteria are more focused and clear to employees. Second, this rating scale also helps in creating a fairer and more objective evaluation environment by reducing the possibility of personal bias in the assessment. Furthermore, the use of measurable and relevant behavioral criteria provides additional motivation for employees to achieve the behavioral standards expected by the organization, thereby stimulating overall performance improvements. The rating scale also facilitates the identification of development areas that an individual needs to improve, assisting in more effective career development planning. Lastly, behavior-based rating scales provide fairer recognition based on the real contributions of each individual, creating an inclusive work culture and providing a fair opportunity for all employees to thrive. Thus, the development of behavior-based assessment scales is an effective solution in overcoming the challenges of subjectivity and lack of fairness in performance evaluation, as well as providing significant benefits for organizations in achieving their goals effectively.

## REFERENCES

- Armstrong, M., Yusron, L., & others. (2021). *Pengembangan Sumber Daya Manusia: Handbook Manajemen SDM*. Nusamedia.
- Armstrong, S. (2010). *human resource management. Choice Reviews Online* (Vol. 47). <https://doi.org/10.5860/choice.47-5751>

- Dessler, G. (2020). *Fundamentals of human resource management*. Pearson.
- Dessler, G., & others. (2015). Manajemen sumber daya manusia. *Jakarta: Salemba Empat*.
- Mayes, M. D. (2012). Principles of management. *Scleroderma: From Pathogenesis to Comprehensive Management*, 571–576. [https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4419-5774-0\\_47](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4419-5774-0_47)
- Murtiningsih, R. S. (2020). The Impact of Compensation, Training & Development, and Organizational Culture on Job Satisfaction and employee Retention. *Indonesian Management and Accounting Research*, 19(1), 33–50. <https://doi.org/10.25105/imar.v19i1.6969>
- Naumoska-Sarakinska, B. (2023). Establishing and Maintaining Objective Criteria in Writing and Speaking Feedback Strategies in Efl. *Journal of Teaching English for Specific and Academic Purposes*, 11(1), 233–242. <https://doi.org/10.22190/JTESAP230126016N>
- Nnubia, A. L. (2020). Monetary Incentives And Employee Performance Of Manufacturing Firms In Anambra State. *International Journal of Innovative Finance and Economics Research*, 8(1), 10–22. Retrieved from [www.seahipaj.org](http://www.seahipaj.org)
- Ramli, Y., & Soelton, M. (2019). The Millennial Workforce: How Do They Commit to the Organization? *International Journal of Business, Economics and Law*, 19(5), 7–18. Retrieved from [https://ijbel.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/K19\\_204.pdf](https://ijbel.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/K19_204.pdf)
- Rumawas, W. (2021). *Manajemen Kinerja*. *Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling* (Vol. 53).
- Somu, H., Halid, H., Nasurdin, A. M., Lim, Y. Y., & Tan, C. L. (2020). Human Resource Management Practices (Training and Development, Performance Appraisal, and Reward System) as Latent Predictors of Job Performance: A Technology-Based Model Development, (141), 42–47. <https://doi.org/10.2991/aebmr.k.200514.010>
- Théry, C., Witwer, K. W., Aikawa, E., Alcaraz, M. J., Anderson, J. D., Andriantsitohaina, R., ... Zuba-Surma, E. K. (2018). Minimal information for studies of extracellular vesicles 2018 (MISEV2018): a position statement of the International Society for Extracellular Vesicles and update of the MISEV2014 guidelines. *Journal of Extracellular Vesicles*, 7(1). <https://doi.org/10.1080/20013078.2018.1535750>
- Timothy G. Hawkins, P. D. (2020). The Role of Supplier Performance Evaluations in Mitigating Risk: Assessing Evaluation Processes and Behaviors, (831).